

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, by and through  
GOVERNOR GAVIN NEWSOM,  
ATTORNEY GENERAL XAVIER BECERRA,  
and the CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES  
BOARD, STATE OF COLORADO, STATE  
OF CONNECTICUT, STATE OF  
DELAWARE, STATE OF HAWAII, STATE  
OF ILLINOIS, STATE OF MAINE, STATE  
OF MARYLAND, COMMONWEALTH OF  
MASSACHUSETTS, PEOPLE OF THE  
STATE OF MICHIGAN, STATE OF  
MINNESOTA, STATE OF NEVADA, STATE  
OF NEW JERSEY, STATE OF NEW  
MEXICO, STATE OF NEW YORK, STATE  
OF NORTH CAROLINA, STATE OF  
OREGON, COMMONWEALTH OF  
PENNSYLVANIA, STATE OF RHODE  
ISLAND, STATE OF VERMONT,  
COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, STATE  
OF WASHINGTON, STATE OF WISCONSIN,  
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, CITY OF LOS  
ANGELES, CITY OF NEW YORK, CITY  
AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO, and  
CITY AND COUNTY OF DENVER,

Petitioners,

v.

ANDREW R. WHEELER, in his official  
capacity as Administrator, United States  
Environmental Protection Agency; UNITED  
STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION  
AGENCY; ELAINE L. CHAO, in her official  
capacity as Secretary, United States Department

No. \_\_\_\_\_

of Transportation; UNITED STATES  
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION;  
JAMES C. OWENS, in his official capacity as  
Acting Administrator, National Highway Traffic  
Safety Administration; NATIONAL  
HIGHWAY TRAFFIC SAFETY  
ADMINISTRATION,

Respondents.

### **PETITION FOR REVIEW**

Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1) (Clean Air Act § 307(b)(1)), 49 U.S.C. § 32909(a)(1), Rule 15 of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure, and D.C. Circuit Rule 15, the States of California, by and through Governor Gavin Newsom, Attorney General Xavier Becerra, and the California Air Resources Board, Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, Hawaii, Illinois, Maine, Maryland, Minnesota, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, North Carolina, Oregon, Rhode Island, Vermont, Washington, and Wisconsin, the Commonwealths of Massachusetts, Pennsylvania, and Virginia, the People of the State of Michigan, the District of Columbia, the Cities of Los Angeles and New York, the City and County of San Francisco, and the City and County of Denver (collectively, Petitioners) hereby petition this Court for review of the final actions of Respondents United States Environmental Protection Agency and Administrator Andrew R. Wheeler, in his official capacity, United States Department of

Transportation and Secretary Elaine L. Chao, in her official capacity, the National Highway Safety Administration and Acting Administrator James C. Owens, in his official capacity, set forth in the Federal Register notice published at 85 Fed. Reg. 24,174 (Apr. 30, 2020) and titled “The Safer Affordable Fuel-Efficient (SAFE) Vehicles Rule for Model Years 2021-2026 Passenger Cars and Light Trucks.”

This petition also seeks review of EPA’s action titled “Mid-Term Evaluation of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards for Model Year 2022-2025 Light-Duty Vehicles,” set forth in the Federal Register notice published at 83 Fed. Reg. 16,077 (Apr. 13, 2018). *See* 5 U.S.C. § 704 (“A preliminary, procedural, or intermediate agency action or ruling not directly reviewable is subject to review on the review of the final agency action.”).

Dated: May 27, 2020

Respectfully Submitted,

FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
ROBERT BYRNE  
EDWARD H. OCHOA  
Senior Assistant Attorneys General  
GARY E. TAVETIAN  
DAVID A. ZONANA  
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General  
JESSICA BARCLAY-STROBEL  
JULIA K. FORGIE  
MEREDITH HANKINS  
JENNIFER KALNINS TEMPLE  
KAVITA LESSER  
M. ELAINE MECKENSTOCK  
ROBERT D. SWANSON  
JONATHAN A. WIENER  
DAVID ZAFT  
Deputy Attorneys General

/s/ Carolyn Nelson Rowan  
CAROLYN NELSON ROWAN  
Deputy Attorney General  
1300 I Street, 15<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Telephone: (916) 210-7814  
Fax: (916) 322-5609  
Carolyn.Rowan@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
California, by and through its Governor  
Gavin Newsom, Attorney General Xavier  
Becerra, and California Air Resources  
Board*

FOR THE STATE OF COLORADO

PHIL WEISER  
Colorado Attorney General

/s/ Eric R. Olson

ERIC R. OLSON  
Solicitor General  
Office of the Attorney General  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
Telephone: (720) 508-6548  
eric.olson@coag.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Colorado*

FOR THE STATE OF CONNECTICUT

WILLIAM TONG  
Attorney General of Connecticut  
MATTHEW I. LEVINE  
Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Scott N. Koschwitz

SCOTT N. KOSCHWITZ  
Assistant Attorney General  
55 Elm Street, P.O. Box 120  
Hartford, CT 06141-0120  
Telephone: (860) 808-5250  
Fax: (860) 808-5386  
Scott.Koschwitz@ct.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Connecticut*

FOR THE STATE OF DELAWARE

KATHLEEN JENNINGS  
Attorney General of the State of  
Delaware

/s/ Kayli H. Spialter

KAYLI H. SPIALTER  
CHRISTIAN WRIGHT  
Deputy Attorneys General  
Delaware Department of Justice  
820 N. French Street, 6th Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Telephone: (302) 395-2604  
Kayli.spialter@delaware.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Delaware*

FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

KARL A. RACINE  
Attorney General for the District of  
Columbia

/s/ Loren L. AliKhan

LOREN L. ALIKHAN  
Solicitor General  
Office of the Attorney General for the  
District of Columbia  
One Judiciary Square  
441 4th Street, NW, Suite 630 South  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Telephone: (202) 727-6287  
Fax: (202) 730-1864  
Loren.AliKhan@dc.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner District of  
Columbia*

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAII

CLARE E. CONNORS  
Attorney General

/s/ William F. Cooper

WILLIAM F. COOPER  
Deputy Attorney General  
State of Hawaii Office of the Attorney  
General

425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
Telephone: (808) 586-4070  
Bill.F.Cooper@Hawaii.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of Hawaii*

FOR THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

KWAME RAOUL  
Attorney General of Illinois  
MATTHEW J. DUNN  
Chief, Environmental Enforcement/  
Asbestos Litigation Division  
JASON E. JAMES  
Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Daniel I. Rottenberg

DANIEL I. ROTTENBERG  
Assistant Attorney General  
69 W. Washington St., 18th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60602  
Telephone: (312) 814-3816  
DRottenberg@atg.state.il.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of Illinois*

FOR THE STATE OF MAINE

AARON M. FREY  
Attorney General of Maine

/s/ Laura E. Jensen

LAURA E. JENSEN  
Assistant Attorney General  
6 State House Station  
Augusta, ME 04333  
Telephone: (207) 626-8868  
Fax: (207) 626-8812  
Laura.Jensen@maine.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of Maine*

FOR THE STATE OF MARYLAND

BRIAN E. FROSH  
Attorney General of Maryland

/s/ Cynthia M. Weisz

CYNTHIA M. WEISZ  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
Maryland Department of the  
Environment  
1800 Washington Blvd.  
Baltimore, MD 21230  
Telephone: (410) 537-3014  
cynthia.weisz2@maryland.gov

JOHN B. HOWARD, JR.  
JOSHUA M. SEGAL  
STEVEN J. GOLDSTEIN  
Special Assistant Attorneys General  
Office of the Attorney General  
200 St. Paul Place  
Baltimore, MD 21202  
Telephone: (410) 576-6300  
jbhoward@oag.state.md.us  
jsegal@oag.state.md.us  
sgoldstein@oag.state.md.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Maryland*



FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF  
MASSACHUSETTS

MAURA HEALEY  
Attorney General  
CHRISTOPHE COURCHESNE  
Assistant Attorney General  
Chief, Environmental Protection  
Division  
CAROL IANCU  
Assistant Attorney General  
MEGAN M. HERZOG  
DAVID S. FRANKEL  
Special Assistant Attorneys General

/s/ Matthew Ireland  
MATTHEW IRELAND  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
Environmental Protection Division  
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor  
Boston, MA 02108  
Telephone: (617) 727-2200  
matthew.ireland@mass.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner Commonwealth  
of Massachusetts*

FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF  
MICHIGAN

DANA NESSEL  
Attorney General of Michigan  
  
/s/ Neil D. Gordon  
NEIL D. GORDON  
GILLIAN E. WENER  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Michigan Department of Attorney  
General  
Environment, Natural Resources  
and Agriculture Division  
P.O. Box 30755  
Lansing, MI 48909  
Telephone: (517) 335-7664  
gordonn1@michigan.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner People of the  
State of Michigan*

FOR THE STATE OF MINNESOTA

KEITH ELLISON  
Attorney General of Minnesota

/s/ Peter N. Surdo

PETER N. SURDO  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 900  
St. Paul, MN, 55101  
Telephone: (651) 757-1061  
Peter.Surdo@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Minnesota*

FOR THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY

GURBIR S. GREWAL  
Attorney General of New Jersey

/s/ Lisa Morelli

LISA MORELLI  
Deputy Attorney General  
25 Market St., PO Box 093  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0093  
Telephone: (609) 376-2745  
Fax: (609) 341-5031  
lisa.morelli@law.njoag.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of New  
Jersey*

FOR THE STATE OF NEVADA

AARON D. FORD  
Attorney General of Nevada

/s/ Heidi Parry Stern

HEIDI PARRY STERN  
Solicitor General  
DANIEL P. NUBEL  
Deputy Attorney General  
Office of the Nevada Attorney General  
100 N. Carson Street  
Carson City, NV 89701  
HStern@ag.nv.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of Nevada*

FOR THE STATE OF NEW MEXICO

HECTOR BALDERAS  
Attorney General of New Mexico

/s/ William Grantham

WILLIAM GRANTHAM  
Assistant Attorney General  
State of New Mexico Office of the  
Attorney General  
Consumer & Environmental Protection  
Division  
201 Third Street NW, Suite 300  
Albuquerque, NM 87102  
Telephone: (505) 717-3520  
wgrantham@nmag.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of New  
Mexico*

FOR THE STATE OF NEW YORK

LETITIA JAMES  
Attorney General of New York  
YUEH-RU CHU  
Chief, Affirmative Litigation Section  
Environmental Protection Bureau  
AUSTIN THOMPSON  
Assistant Attorney General

/s/ Gavin G. McCabe

GAVIN G. MCCABE  
Assistant Attorney General  
28 Liberty Street, 19th Floor  
New York, NY 10005  
Telephone: (212) 416-8469  
gavin.mccabe@ag.ny.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of New  
York*

FOR THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA

JOSHUA H. STEIN  
Attorney General  
DANIEL S. HIRSCHMAN  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
FRANCISCO BENZONI  
Special Deputy Attorney General

/s/ Asher P. Spiller

ASHER P. SPILLER  
TAYLOR CRABTREE  
Assistant Attorneys General  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 629  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
Telephone: (919) 716-6400

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of North  
Carolina*

FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM  
Attorney General of Oregon

/s/ Paul Garrahan

PAUL GARRAHAN  
Attorney-in-Charge  
STEVE NOVICK  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
Natural Resources Section  
Oregon Department of Justice  
1162 Court Street NE  
Salem, OR 97301-4096  
Telephone: (503) 947-4593  
Paul.Garrahan@doj.state.or.us  
Steve.Novick@doj.state.or.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Oregon*

FOR THE STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

PETER F. NERONHA  
Attorney General of Rhode Island

/s/ Gregory S. Schultz

GREGORY S. SCHULTZ  
Special Assistant Attorney General  
Office of Attorney General  
150 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
Telephone: (401) 274-4400  
gschultz@riag.ri.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of Rhode  
Island*

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF  
PENNSYLVANIA

JOSH SHAPIRO  
Attorney General of Pennsylvania

/s/ Ann R. Johnston

ANN R. JOHNSTON  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
Office of Attorney General  
Strawberry Square  
14th Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17120  
Telephone: (717) 705-6938  
ajohnston@attorneygeneral.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner Commonwealth  
of Pennsylvania*

FOR THE STATE OF VERMONT

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.  
Attorney General

/s/ Nicholas F. Persampieri

NICHOLAS F. PERSAMPIERI  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Attorney General  
109 State Street  
Montpelier, VT 05609  
Telephone: (802) 828-3171  
nick.persampieri@vermont.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Vermont*

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA

MARK R. HERRING

Attorney General

PAUL KUGELMAN, JR.

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Chief, Environmental Section

/s/ Caitlin C. G. O'Dwyer

CAITLIN C. G. O'DWYER

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

Commonwealth of Virginia

202 North 9th Street

Richmond, VA 23219

Telephone: (804) 786-1780

godwyer@oag.state.va.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner Commonwealth  
of Virginia*

FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON

ROBERT W. FERGUSON

Attorney General

/s/ Emily C. Nelson

EMILY C. NELSON

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

P.O. Box 40117

Olympia, WA 98504

Telephone: (360) 586-4607

emily.nelson@atg.wa.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Washington*

FOR THE STATE OF WISCONSIN

JOSHUA L. KAUL  
Attorney General of Wisconsin

/s/ Jennifer L. Vandermeuse

JENNIFER L. VANDERMEUSE

GABE JOHNSON-KARP  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, WI 53702-7857  
Telephone: (608) 266-7741 (JLV)  
                  (608) 267-8904 (GJK)  
Fax: (608) 267-2223  
vandermeusejl@doj.state.wi.us  
johnsonkarp@doj.state.wi.us

*Attorneys for Petitioner State of  
Wisconsin*

FOR THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES

MICHAEL N. FEUER  
Los Angeles City Attorney  
MICHAEL J. BOSTROM  
Assistant City Attorney

/s/ Michael J. Bostrom

MICHAEL J. BOSTROM  
Assistant City Attorney  
200 N. Spring Street, 14<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90012  
Telephone: (213) 978-1867  
Fax: (213) 978-2286  
Michael.Bostrom@lacity.org

*Attorneys for Petitioner City of Los  
Angeles*

FOR THE CITY OF NEW YORK

JAMES E. JOHNSON  
New York City Corporation Counsel  
CHRISTOPHER G. KING  
ROBERT L. MARTIN  
Senior Counsel  
SHIVA PRAKASH  
Assistant Corporation Counsel

/s/ Christopher G. King  
CHRISTOPHER G. KING  
Senior Counsel  
New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, New York  
Telephone: (212) 356-2074  
Fax: (212) 356-2084  
cking@law.nyc.gov

*Attorneys for Petitioner City of New York*

FOR THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

DENNIS J. HERRERA  
City Attorney  
ROBB W. KAPLA  
Deputy City Attorney

/s/ Robb W. Kapla  
ROBB W. KAPLA  
Deputy City Attorney  
City Hall, Room 234  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, California 94102-4602  
Telephone: (415) 554-4746  
Fax: (415) 554-4715  
Robb.Kapla@sfcityatty.org

*Attorneys for Petitioner City and County of San Francisco*

FOR THE CITY AND COUNTY OF DENVER

KRISTIN M. BRONSON

City Attorney

EDWARD J. GORMAN

LINDSAY S. CARDER

Assistant City Attorneys

/s/ Edward J. Gorman

EDWARD J. GORMAN

Assistant City Attorney

Denver City Attorney's Office

201 W. Colfax Avenue, Dept. 1207

Denver, Colorado 80202

Telephone: (720) 913-3275

Edward.Gorman@denvergov.org

*Attorneys for Petitioner City and County  
of Denver*



## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that pursuant to Circuit Rule 15(a), a copy of the foregoing Petition for Review was served on May 27, 2020 by certified mail, return receipt requested, on the following:

Hon. Andrew R. Wheeler  
Office of the Administrator (1101A)  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20460

Hon. William Barr  
Attorney General of the United States  
U.S. Department of Justice  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20530

Correspondence Control Unit  
Office of General Counsel (2311)  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20460

Hon. James C. Owens  
Acting Administrator  
National Highway Traffic Safety Administration  
1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE  
West Building  
Washington, D.C. 20590

National Highway Traffic Safety Administration  
NHTSA Headquarters  
1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE  
West Building  
Washington, D.C. 20590

Hon. Elaine L. Chao  
Office of the Secretary  
United States Department of Transportation  
1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE  
West Building  
Washington, D.C. 20590

Office of the General Counsel  
United States Department of Transportation  
1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE  
West Building  
Washington, D.C. 20590

/s/ Valerie A. Tamulevich  
VALERIE A. TAMULEVICH